

The interaction between language identity, pedagogy, and the effects on indigenous languages (Urdu and Sindhi): A case study of undergraduate institutes of Sindh, Pakistan

Habibullah Pathan¹, Ghadah Al Murshidi², Shazia Ayyaz³, Illahi Bakhsh^{4*}, Urooj Fatima Alvi⁵

¹ Faculty of Language Studies, Sohar University, Sohar 311, Oman

² United Arab Emirates University, Al Ain 15551, UAE

³ Al Zahra College for Women, Muscat 112, Oman

⁴ University of Sindh, Jamshoro 59201, Pakistan

⁵ University of Education, Lahore 05450, Pakistan

* **Corresponding author:** Illahi Bakhsh, illahibux.gopang@usindh.edu.pk

CITATION

Pathan H, Al Murshidi G, Ayyaz S, et al. (2024). The interaction between language identity, pedagogy, and the effects on indigenous languages (Urdu and Sindhi): A case study of undergraduate institutes of Sindh, Pakistan. *Forum for Linguistic Studies*. 6(2): 1176.
<https://doi.org/10.59400/fls.v6i2.1176>

ARTICLE INFO

Received: 10 January 2024

Accepted: 20 February 2024

Available online: 27 March 2024

COPYRIGHT



Copyright © 2024 by author(s).

Forum for Linguistic Studies is published by Academic Publishing Pte. Ltd. This work is licensed under the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY) license.

<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>

Abstract: The purpose of the article is to examine the correlation between language and identity, as well as the influence of English language instruction in Pakistan on Pakistani linguistic identities. While English language learners use a variety of teaching and learning strategies, they also come from a range of socioeconomic backgrounds and have varied learning objectives. The data collection involved two hundred undergraduates from each of the two campuses of the University of Sindh, one located in Jamshoro and the other in Hyderabad, Sindh, Pakistan. Additionally, interviews were conducted with five English language instructors who were all affiliated with the University of Sindh. Qualitative methods were utilized by the researcher for this investigation. The researcher employed two survey questionnaires, one for teachers and one for students, as a crucial tool for data gathering. The findings of the article demonstrate that language plays a significant role in expressing one's social or personal identity, serving as a single characteristic of language usage for identification. Moreover, the article also examined the influence of English on two Pakistani languages, Urdu and Sindhi. Following the acquisition of English language skills, individuals may perceive changes in their level of competence, communication style, and value systems. The inclination towards code-mixing in public discourse can be attributed to the English language, as Pakistanis are highly conscious of their social status and aspire to appear well-educated.

Keywords: culture; English; identity; image; languages; Pakistan

1. Introduction

Identity and language are linked to one another. Learners cannot acquire any language in the world if they lack language and identity. Language shapes our identity, culture, and manner of thinking and it grows under the effects of our surroundings' ongoing variations. The study looks at the relationship that exists between languages and identity. Despite this fact, learners of English possess varying motivations for acquiring the English language, as well as distinct socio-political contexts and approaches to English language instruction and acquisition. According to Norton (2000), identities are people's perceptions of how they fit into a socially constructed and dynamically negotiated environment. Additionally, Norton (2010) characterizes people's identities as a locus of difficulty in that "[e]very time we talk, we are reconstructing that connection across time and space and

negotiations and re-negotiating our sense of self concerning a larger social world". In a similar vein, linguistic ideologies, political structures, and power dynamics all play a significant role in how language learners negotiate their identities (Pavlenko and Blackledge, 2004). Researchers like Canagarajah (2010) stated about the floating identification and politics of identity. Woodward (2002) and Bhabha (1994) stated about the third space in cultural identity that is affected through foreign language pedagogy. The third space is the development of poststructuralist identities that explain the complicate nature of identities of second language learners. They found in their study that what do language and identity entail, and how are they related, lastly, how does English language instruction affect linguistic identity?

Students learning English as a second language come to the classroom with pre-existing cultural and linguistic knowledge from diverse origins. Foreign language acquisition frequently involves a multilayered and ongoing negotiation of identities because learning and practicing a second language requires not just the development of novel language abilities and norms but additionally suitable ways of utilizing language as well as thinking, valuing, and acting, to function as an efficient member of the new discourse group (Eckert, 2000; Marsh, 2002; Norton, 2001, 2010; Norton Pierce, 1995). L2 learners go through a process that involves negotiation, renegotiation, and change not only when they are physically introduced to the new cultural and language group but also when they progressively learn new societal and linguistic norms and focus on language acquisition (Peng and Patterson, 2022). According to Kramsch (2000), language learners' cultural background, social position, and discursive voice all contribute to their language and learner identity in L2 and account for their deliberate selection of a particular role or identity to assert and exhibit in various circumstances. Finding patterns in the relationships between languages and identities is the primary goal of this article. When students of multiple languages bring their previously learned identities into the classroom, language, and identity play a particularly significant role in L2 learning environments. Language learners typically go through a procedure of negotiation and renegotiation of their identities, which occasionally results in a process of resistance, because their earlier developed personal identities and repertoire may conflict with established standards or not be acknowledged within a new discourse community. All around the world, language is naturally acquired. It may also be studied as an additional language. The relationships between language and identities are shaped by naturally occurring acquisition and learning. The relationship between "national identity" and "national language" is a significant one in terms of language and identity. Formal instruction in schools may either increase or decrease this connection. For example, in Pakistan, where Urdu remains the national language, English has largely overtaken Urdu as the language of choice for mode of communication. The youth of Pakistan appear uncomfortable when they use Urdu in public or anywhere else since our media has started to expose Western culture on a much larger scale and has led us to believe that our educational system, which encourages studying in Urdu, is useless. Our educational system faces a dilemma between English and Urdu instruction; although the latter is only inferior, the former has privileges. English is now being used as a means to help us differentiate between the upper and poor classes due to globalization of English language. This characteristic made learning a language,

especially L2, more difficult (Rahman, 2004).

2. Literature review

2.1. Language-communication influence on learners of language

Language is a means by which people organize themselves, assert authority over others, and convey how they see themselves about other people. In second language study, the poststructuralist idea of imagination has been used to describe the intricate links between language learners' identities, investments, and wants to expand their identities beyond socially contextualized positional ties. The first talk of imagination in the classroom arose from Vygotsky's (1978) realization that children's and later adults' language development is greatly influenced by imagination, a high mental function. Bagiyan et al. (2021) discussed how imagination can play a key role in learning a language because it helps students decide which practices are worthwhile and motivates them to work hard to realize their desired or imagined futures in community life extending on their assertions. Wenger (1998) defined imaginations as "a means of extending our self by transcending the limitations of space and time to generate novel perceptions of the globe and ourselves" (p. 176).

2.2. Identity-language: A complex relationship

According to Clément and Norton (2021), "the language and power may function to promote or limit the range of identity that language learners may establish in their educational settings and communities," describing the complicated interaction between language and identity (p. 9). These critical viewpoints have served as inspiration for current research examining the identities of L2 learners in connection to power dynamics, socio-political structures, and prevailing ideologies. A major focus of L2 research has successfully shifted from an intellectual and linguistic-oriented approach towards social and cultural factors. This allows researchers to comprehend the learning of second languages in connection with socio-political arrangements, language learners' diverse backgrounds and their agent-based roles with power relations. Future studies have to tackle and critically analyze the problems to comprehend the multi-layered identity of those learning a second language in a society that is always changing and evolving. Many academics have described second language learners' varied affiliations and belongings across many societies using the concept of multiple identities. The majorities of study findings have conceptualized the several identities that second language learners create, negotiate, and evolve during the process of learning a language (Pidduck et al., 2022; Petreñas et al., 2018; Rentschler et al., 2023). Norton (1995) noted that among her many identities, Martina's (one participant) identity in society as a mother and primary caretaker in her family is the source of her investment in English. How can we distinguish clearly between identity A and identity B if language learners, as previously suggested, are constantly negotiating several identities?

2.3. Concept of imagined identities and communities

The common language used to communicate among individuals from many countries is English. The fact that English is the world's dominant language is one of the main arguments in favor of interpreting it as a global language. English proficiency contributes to these nations' continued high standards of academic and scientific performance. According to Pavlenko (2003), students were able to recast their identities and re-imagine themselves as members of a newly imagined multilingual community of users where their multilingualism and multi-competence were valued assets through seminars and classroom discussions. Put differently, language learners might undergo a process of metamorphosis as a result of their interactions with neighboring discourses, which can enlarge and modify their imagined communities and identities. Spiliotopoulous and Carey (2005) investigated identities of foreign language users in different academic contexts such as the classroom observed of computer-mediated communication. Dagenais et al. (2009) worked on the multimodal communication. Barkhuizen and Klerik (2006) presented pre-immigrant initiatives taken by the imaginary communities. Kingler (2004) presented the communities, who are gathered for the study purpose abroad.

2.4. Position of English around the globe-specific reference to Pakistan

Kachru (1985) used the paradigm of the three concentric circles—the inner, outer, and expanding circles—to explain how English expanded. He claims that the native English-speaking nations of the United States of America (USA), United Kingdom (UK), Canada, Australia, and New Zealand are included in the inner circle. The institutionalized varieties that are not native, English as second language learners (ESL) in areas like India that have seen protracted colonization are represented by the “Outer Circle” (p. 366). The widening circle includes nations where English is spoken as a foreign language by English as foreign language learners (EFL), such as China. This definition places Pakistan in an outer group of nations where English is taught as the only language that is required in schools and is recognized as an official language alongside Urdu. Since, English is a required course for under-graduates; it becomes a stronger language at the university level in Pakistan. Additionally, it serves as the exclusive teaching medium for graduate and undergraduate students. After students pass the English language test, they are awarded degrees in the social sciences, humanities, and sciences. English has a unique significance in the social and economic realms, surpassing that of Urdu, due to its economic, political, and cultural demands alongside the societal significance attributed to it by the nation's governing class (Rahman, 1997). In the same stream, Rehman (1997) also claims that to gain the support from the middle class in cities and sustain their power in the provinces; the governing elites in Pakistan appear to have favored Urdu due to its integrative symbolic significance. The ability to speak English acts as a gatekeeper for younger, more elite generations seeking to join executive roles and broadens their prospects of finding employment abroad (ibid). However, this is oblique support. Therefore, the children of the common people attend government-funded schools in Urdu, while the children of the rich attend pricey English-language institutions. English is widely used in Pakistan in practically

every aspect of life, including higher education, science and technology, media, industry, and youth culture. As was previously indicated, Rahman (1997) contends that Urdu-medium schools receive very little social and economic support, with English being imposed instead. According to research done in Karachi, Pakistan, in 2007 by Ashraf, the English language is associated with prestige and authority there. Mansoor (2002) addressed how learning English influences learners' identities because it is frequently viewed as a way to advance socially in Pakistan. In multilingual challenges, Macias (2023) has investigated the relationship between language and cultural identity.

2.5. Language-cultural interaction in Pakistani classroom settings

Ineffective English teaching methods are not similar to the natural process of language acquisition, and language learners' inability to demonstrate proficiency in the language is evident. Languages have two main purposes: they are markers of social identity and a means of communication. Identity and language use are both dynamic concepts that change based on the situation and the environment. As stated by Darwin and Norton (2021), cultural identity by language learning may be understood as the process of self-awareness that drives a person's language learning. The impact of English on all other languages has grown as a result of globalization and the Pakistani government's continued colonial language policies, but the English language education system has many flaws that need to be fixed if the nation is to continue to achieve high standards in intellectual and scientific training. According to Lynch and Motha (2023), as digital technology becomes more and more ingrained in daily life, language and identity ought to become more universal. There are two categories of contemporary identity and language studies. The first is exterior impacts, which include classroom instruction and cross-cultural adaptation.

3. Research methodology

The present paper aims to investigate the connection between identity and language as well as the extent to which English language instruction in Pakistan is influencing the identities of Pakistani speakers. This study also looks at the idea that one's identity is shaped by their language. The approach used in the research is qualitative. All of the English language instructors and students in Hyderabad and Jamshoro made up the study's population. Two hundred under-graduates from each of the campuses of the University of Sindh were selected. Hundred from each of the two campuses—Allama I. I. Qazi (the main University) and Elsa Qazi (Hyderabad's Campus)—participated in the data collection. Nevertheless, five English language instructors—all of who were affiliated with the University of Sindh—were also interviewed for this study. For this study, the researcher employed both quantitative and qualitative methods. The researcher employed two questionnaires, one for teachers and one for students, as an essential means to gather data. Due to time and resource constraints, the study employed the convenient sampling approach. The questionnaire was divided into two sections: one for teachers and one for under-graduates. For the students, a closed-ended questionnaire was created, and for the instructors, an open-ended one. Five open-ended questions

were prepared for the English language instructors to utilize during the interview, and thirteen questions were centered on identity as well as language from the viewpoint of language instruction within Pakistan for the students. The mean value and response frequency were used to evaluate the data. The data was measured using SPSS (26 version) for this purpose. The five-point Likert scale was used in the questionnaire’s design for students.

4. Findings

4.1. First part of study: (Students’ responses) on the impact of English pedagogy on their linguistic identity

The questionnaire used in this study was analyzed to determine the impact of teaching English on Pakistani linguistic identities as well as the link between language and identity. The responses of the students were assessed in the first part.

Table 1. Student’s Responses

Items Asked	Strongly-Disagree	Disagree	Uncertain	Agree	Strongly-agree	Value of Mean
The importance that language plays on an individual’s identity	2	5	2	107	84	4.46
Your identity (national and personal) is represented by the English language.	2	11	3	102	82	4.22
You feel comfortable giving a speech in front of the class.	7	60	10	61	62	3.50
Identity and language are not flexible; rather, they are intricate processes	19	20	21	82	58	3.71
The use of the English language as a symbol of power	0	13	10	82	95	4.31
Learning English weakens the ties between your identity and L1.	2	23	13	71	91	4.17
You have no problem with the English language education system in Pakistan.	3	9	6	97	85	4.24
You frequently mix up the languages.	3	32	15	68	82	3.71
Cultural differences have a big influence on L2 learning.	6	21	25	106	42	3.76
Speaking English demonstrates your status as an educated individual.	1	11	8	85	95	4.36
You start to feel anxious and forget what the English teacher asked you.	6	13	4	80	97	4.25
You are pleased with the English language education system in Pakistan.	60	73	12	25	30	2.46
Learning of L2 influences L1.	7	25	28	73	67	3.80

The goal of the study is to investigate the extent to which Pakistani linguistic identities are being impacted by English instruction in that country.

The results of the present study are displayed in the above table. The interpretation of data about language reflects an individual’s identity, ranging from strongly agreeing with the minority to strongly disagreeing with the majority, which is represented by 107 (53.5%) of the participants who agreed. Nonetheless, the

significance of the results indicates that most participants concurred that language is an essential component of an individual's identity. 84 of the 200 participants strongly agreed, while 5 disagreed.

The positive impact is explained in the second question. The data explication about the English language indicates your identification (personal and national), ranging from highly agree to completely disagreeing with the majority of those surveyed, which is represented by 102 (51%) of those surveyed who agreed. Nonetheless, the significance of the results indicates that most participants concurred that your identity (personal or national) is reflected in your command of the English language. Of the 200 participants, 82 strongly agreed with the statement, and 11 disagreed.

The good motivation is higher in the third question. The data explanation for their confidence in speaking effectively in front of the class ranges from highly agree to strongly disagree, with the majority, or 62 (31%) of participants, showing strong agreement. The results, however, indicate that most participants felt secure enough to talk effectively in front of the class. 61 of the 200 participants agreed, while 60 disagreed.

The fourth statement discussed language's intricate processes and how identity is not dynamic. The data explanation process concerning identity and language is not dynamic; rather, it involves complicated procedures ranging from highly agree to strongly disagree, with the majority of participants (82, or 41%) showing that they agreed. The results, however, indicate that most participants felt that identity as well as language complicated processes rather than dynamic ones. 58 of the 200 participants strongly agreed, while 21 were unsure.

The usage of the English language as a symbol of power was discussed in the fifth response. The data interpretation on the English language is utilized as a status indicator, ranging from strongly agreeing to strongly disagreeing with the majority, with 95 (47.5%) of the respondents showing strong agreement. Nonetheless, the significance of the results indicates that most participants concurred that the English language is utilized as a symbol of power. 13 of the 200 participants disagreed, while 82 agreed.

The sixth statement discussed how learning English weakens the connections between your identity and L1. Learning English weakens the description of data regarding the relationships between your L1 and self-identity by shifting the choice from a strong agreement to a strong disagreement with the majority, which is represented by 91 (45.5%) of participants who strongly agreed. Nonetheless, the significance of the results indicates that most participants felt that learning English weakens the connections between your first language and identity. 71 of the 200 participants agreed, while 23 disagreed.

Regarding their satisfaction with the English language education system in Pakistan, the seventh response was presented. The data explanation reveals that 48.5% of the participants, or 97 out of the total, highly agree with the Pakistani method of English language instruction, while the other 3 percent strongly disagree. The results, however, indicate that most participants agreed that they are happy with the English language education system in Pakistan. Among the 200 individuals, 9 disagreed and 85 strongly agreed.

They often mix up the languages, according to the eighth respondent. The explanation of the data reveals that 82 (41%) of the participants strongly agreed, with the majority having a habit of blending languages ranging from strongly agree to strongly disagree. Nonetheless, the significance of the results indicates that most participants concurred that they frequently mix up their languages. Of the 200 participants, 32 disagreed and 68 agreed.

The ninth response talked about how cultural differences have a big influence on learning L2. The data's interpretation concerning cultural variety has a significant influence on second language acquisition, ranging from highly agree to strongly disagree, with 106 (53%) of the respondents agreeing. However, the results show that most participants felt that cultural variation had a significant influence on learning L2. Of the 200 participants, 25 were unsure and 42 strongly agreed.

Speaking English is a sign of being an educated person, according to the tenth response. The data description of speaking English indicates you identify as an educated person, ranging from strongly agree to strongly disagree with the majority, which is represented by 95 (47.5%) of those who participated strongly agreed. Nonetheless, the significance of the results indicates that most participants concurred that knowing English is a sign of being an educated person. Of the 200 participants, 11 disagreed and 85 agreed.

The eleventh statement talked about how they feel anxious and forget what in the English class where they are supposed to be learning. The explanation of the data in reaction to their anxiety and forgetting what was asked in the English class, with the majority of participants—97, or 48.5%—strongly agreeing on it. Nonetheless, the significance of the results indicates that most participants concurred that they feel anxious and forget what is taught in English class. 13 of the 200 participants disagreed, while 80 agreed.

The twelfth response expressed satisfaction with the English language education system in Pakistan. The data explanation indicates that 73 (36.5%) of the participants disagreed with the majority's statement that they are content with the English language education system in Pakistan, ranging from strongly agreeing to strongly disagreeing. Nonetheless, the implications of the results show that most participants disagreed that the English language education system in Pakistan meets their needs. 30 of the 200 participants strongly agreed, while 60 strongly disagreed.

The final questionnaire response concerned how learning L2 affected L1. The data explanation for how learning L2 affected L1 ranged from a strong agreement to a strong disagreement, with the majority of participants—73 or 36.5%—agreeing. Nonetheless, the significance of the results indicates that most participants concurred that acquiring L2 influenced L1. Of the 200 participants, 67 expressed great concern, and 25 disapproved.

4.2. Second part of study: Evaluation of the teachers' comments on the impact of English pedagogy on their linguistic identity

The interviewees were English language instructors. They addressed the following queries:

Table 2. Teacher's comments.

Question Number 1: Do you think a language defines an identity? If so, describe in more detail how your identity and first language are related.

Question Number 2: How does a language affect a person's identity?

Question Number 3: Does losing one's language mean losing one's identity?

Question Number 4: To what extent are Pakistani languages' identities being impacted by English language instruction?

Question Number 5: Are regional languages like Sindhi, Urdu, and others becoming less significant in today's world because of English? If so, how.

Collective Responses of teachers are stated:

- Speaking a language as a first language allows one to signal and serves as a marker of identity. Other people also classify persons based on the language that they speak.
- People have several social identities and are members of numerous social groups. They partially absorb each other's languages during interactions, and once they begin speaking them, it affects both their identities and their native tongue. Language has this kind of impact on an individual's identity.
- It is correct, of course. The relationship between identity and language is very significant. We can also claim that there has been a loss of self-identity if there has been a loss of linguistic linkage. A person loses both his identity and his first language when they are completely proficient in a second language.
- Language has a significant role in expressing one's identity, and those who use it as their first language utilize it to communicate. Individuals are also classified by other individuals based on the language they use.
- The identity of the Pakistani language may be somewhat impacted by English language instruction. People speak more English in their speaking because they are more aware of their social standing.
- People have several social identities and belong to multiple social groups, which means language has an impact on identity. They partially acquire each other's languages throughout interactions, and once they begin speaking them, it affects both their identities and their native tongue.
- It is determined that language loss leads to identity loss because when a person masters a new language, he also loses his first language and his identity.
- Undoubtedly, the significance of regional tongues will diminish along with their uniqueness when English is spoken. In our own country, English is a second language (L2). It has its prestige, and most learners mimic Western culture, which undermines our sense of self. Compared to their national holiday, youngsters are more familiar with Halloween, bonfires, balls, Valentine's Day, etc.
- People use more English in their talks because they are more aware of their social standing, which implies that Pakistani languages are being influenced by English to some extent.
- The significance of regional languages will diminish along with their uniqueness when English is spoken. The sanctity of our national identity is being undermined as a result of English's emphasis on its own culture, which is greatly harming our own. This is also true of other regional languages spoken in

Pakistan.

5. Discussion on the research findings

The study employed mixed method to investigate the connection between identity and language as well as the extent to which English language instruction in Pakistan is influencing the identities of Pakistani speakers. For this purpose, the undergraduate students and English teachers were selected as the participants for this study. Two hundred under-graduates from each of the campuses of the University of Sindh were selected. Hundred from each of the two campuses—Allama I. I. Qazi (the main University in Jamshoro) and Elsa Qazi Campus (Campus in Hyderabad)—participated in the data collection. Nevertheless, five English language instructors—all of who were affiliated with the University of Sindh—were also interviewed for this study. From the study findings, it was found that majority of undergraduates learning English as the second language concurred that language is an essential component of an individual's identity. 84 of the 200 participants strongly agreed, while only 5 disagreed. As stated by Ting-Toomey (2015), learning a language is a means of realizing one's identity in many social contexts; it reflects our socioeconomic position (SES), as well as our race, sex nationality, and a host of other characteristics. Secondly, majority of the undergraduates concurred that their identity (personal or national) is reflected as per their command on the English language. Of the 200 participants, 82 strongly agreed with the statement, and 11 disagreed. It must be understood that the identity is socially created; as stated by Sang (2023) that the instructors make use of community and institutional practices to comprehend the circumstances in which language learners read, write, and speak the target language. Similarly, majority of undergraduates felt secure enough to talk effectively in front of the class. It means they had the command on the English. Without its command, they could have been failed to pass their subjects as the basic requirement of their academic career. The Teacher 1 and 3 even felt a realization in their comment that speaking a language as a first language allows one to signal and serves as a marker of identity. However, the focus on English has left over the native identities of undergraduate students. The Teacher 3, clarifying the relation of identity with the language even stated that people also classify persons based on the language that they speak. People have several social identities and are members of numerous social groups in their universities. With this, teacher 5, added to further comment that "It is correct, of course. The relationship between identity and language is very significant". One can also claim that there has been a loss of self-identity if there has been a loss of linguistic linkage. The results of undergraduate students even indicated that most participants felt identity as well as language as complicated processes rather than dynamic ones. 58 of the 200 participants strongly agreed, while 21 were unsure. Identity essentially means being the same. Therefore, it is only natural that when individuals are mostly alike, identity will be most noticeable. However, in reality, this process is more complex (Zhang and Hwang, 2023). On the other hand, people in Pakistan usually focus on English in academics more because they symbolize this language with power. The undergraduate students were surveyed. Majority of undergraduate participants concurred that the English language is

utilized as a symbol of power. 82 of the 200 participants agreed. This similar stance was shared by the teacher 2, as stated, the identity of the Pakistani indigenous languages may be somewhat impacted by English language instruction. People speak more English in their speaking because they are more aware of their social standing. According to Rehman (2004) the ability to generate the prospect of gaining material or immaterial satisfaction is known as power. Consumer and producer products are physical gratifications; prestiges, popularity, the sharing of one's ideas, power over others, and so on are the examples of intangible gratifications. The elite have more influence when computer programs are available in English. Additionally, they save money, which benefits the ruling class even more because it is used to fund other power-grabbing initiatives like strengthening the bureaucracy and military forces, among other things. This has been validated by the teacher 4, while commenting on the importance of English in teaching that has resulted into reshaping the identity of students in Pakistan. The teacher 4, commenting on the status of English stated "undoubtedly, the significance of regional tongues will diminish along with their uniqueness when English is spoken. In our own country, English is a second language (L2). It has its prestige, and most learners mimic Western culture, which undermines our sense of self. Compared to their national holiday, youngsters are more familiar with Halloween, bonfires, balls, Valentine's Day, etc." While surveying the students at University, 97 out of the total, 200 participants agreed to the greater extent that there should be English language education system in Pakistan. They seemed to compromise their native identities with the foreign culture through learning a foreign language (English). It is because the students at this stage can see the benefits of learning English more than their native languages. However, the teachers seemed not to compromise on this phenomenon, as commented by the teacher 1 that the "significance of regional languages will diminish along with their uniqueness when English is spoken. The sanctity of our national identity is being undermined as a result of English's emphasis on its own culture, which is greatly harming our own." Therefore, it can be said that there is a variance of perception between students and the teachers in teaching and learning of English as a foreign language in undergraduate institutes of Sindh, Pakistan.

6. Recommendations—Insight for the future studies

- This study suggests that while developing English curricula or policies, consideration should be paid to the opinions of the students. Furthermore, as Huizhu (2012) says, more chances should be given to comprehend and discuss students' voices, as well as means of communicating should be investigated.
- Given the traditional culture of Pakistan, it is highly advised that parents and students have their opinions heard since youngsters typically speak with their parents before approving their identity or choosing a future vocation.
- It is advised that data be gathered via surveys, parent-teacher conferences, or student-teacher conferences on the family background, history, and present, and prospects of the pupils.
- When creating English language programs or regulations, the data gathered must be taken into account. In an ideal world, local and global cultures would

coexist peacefully in ESL classes, meeting the needs and expectations of the students.

7. Conclusion

It must accept many histories, voices, and identities of L2 learners rather than seeing these distinctions as a cause of language learning difficulties. Additionally, teachers and administrators must provide instruction in the classroom and language teaching strategies that respect the different origins of L2 learners and support them in creating their voices and identities. Macro-level: When deciding how to encourage multilingualism, language practitioners and policymakers should take into account the importance of second language learners' identities in their development and use of language literacy. Future studies must also explore how teachers and scholars might prevent second language learners from becoming imprisoned in identities that are imposed by institutions or society at large. To provide opportunities for second-language learners' voices to be heard and for a real understanding of the different histories and identities of L2 learners, they should more effectively help L2 learners in discovering their positional relationships and identities in second-language situations.

Authors contributions: Conceptualization, HP and IB; methodology, HP; Software, GAM; validation, UFA and IB; formal analysis, GAM; investigation, SA; resources, IB; data curation, HP; writing—original draft preparation, UFA; writing—review and editing, GAM; visualization, IB; supervision, SA; project administration, GAM; funding acquisition, HP. All authors have read and agreed to the published version of the manuscript.

Conflict of interest: The authors declare no conflict of interest.

References

- Ashraf, H. (2007). *A Study of English Language Learning as an Element Affecting the Social Capital of the People of Pakistan* [PhD thesis]. National University of Modern Languages.
- Bagiyan, A. Y., Shiryayeva, T. A., Tikhonova, E. V., & Mekeko, N. M. (2021). The real value of words: how target language linguistic modelling of foreign language teaching content shapes students' professional identity. *Heliyon*, 7, e06581. doi: 10.1016/j.heliyon.2021.e06581
- Barkhuizen, G., & de Klerk, V. (2006). Imagined identities: Pre-immigrants' narratives on language and identity. *International Journal of Bilingualism*, 10(3), 277–299.
- Bhabha, H. (1994). *The location of culture*. Routledge.
- Canagarajah, S. (2010). Achieving community. In: Nunan D, Choi J (editors). *Language and culture: Reflective narratives and the emergence of identity*. Routledge. pp. 41–49.
- Clément, R., & Norton, B. (2021). Ethnolinguistic vitality, identity and power: investment in SLA. *J. Lang. Soc. Psychol.* 40, 154–171. doi: 10.1177/0261927X20966734
- Dagenais, D., Moore, D., Lamarre, S., et al. (2009). Linguistic landscape and language awareness. In: Shohamy E, Gorter D (editors). *Linguistic landscape: Expanding the scenery*. Routledge. pp. 253–269.
- Darvin, R., & Norton, B. (2021). Investment and motivation in language learning: What's the difference? *Lang. Teach.* 56, 29–40. doi: 10.1017/S0261444821000057
- Eckert, P. (2000). *Linguistic variation as social practice*. Blackwell.

- Huizhu, H. (2012). Mutual influences between learners' identity construction and English language learning in the first year of university study in China [Master's thesis]. The University of Hong Kong.
- Kachru, B. B. (1985). Standards, codification and sociolinguistic realism: The English language in the outer circle. In: Quirk R, Widdowson H (editors). *English in the world: Teaching and learning the language and literatures*. Cambridge University Press. pp. 11–36.
- Kinginger, C. (2004). Alice doesn't live here anymore: Foreign language learning and identity construction. In: Pavlenko A, Blackledge A (editors). *Negotiation of identities in multilingual contexts*. *Multilingual Matters*. pp. 219–242.
- Lynch, R., & Motha, S. (2023). Epistemological entanglements: decolonizing understandings of identity and knowledge in English language teaching. *Int. J. Educ. Res.* 118, 102118. doi: 10.1016/j.ijer.2022.102118
- Macias, H. (2023). Language as a marker of cultural identity and commodification: the language socialization practices of multilingual, Latina/Mexican American mothers. *Crit. Inq. Lang. Stud.* 20, 77–104. doi: 10.1080/15427587.2022.2102010
- Mansoor, S. (2002). *The Role of English in Higher Education in Pakistan* [PhD thesis]. University of Reading of Reading, England.
- Marsh, M. (2002). The shaping of Ms.Nicholi: The discursive fashioning of teacher identities. *Qualitative Studies in Education.* 15(3), 333–347.
- Norton Peirce, B. (1995). Social identity, investment, and language learning. *TESOL Quarterly.* 23(3), 401–420.
- Norton, B. (1997). Language, identity, and the ownership of English. *TESOL Quarterly.* 31(3), 409–429.
- Norton, B. (2000). *Identity and language learning: Gender, ethnicity and educational change*. Longman.
- Norton, B. (2001). Non-participation, imagined communities and the language classroom. In: Breen M (editors). *Learner contribution to language learning: New directions in research*. Pearson Education. pp. 159–171.
- Norton, B. (2010). Language and identity. In: Hornberger N, McKay S (editors). *Sociolinguistics and language education*. *Multilingual Matters*. pp. 349–369.
- Pavlenko, A., & Blackledge, A. (2004). Negotiation of identities in multicultural contexts. *Multilingual Matters*.
- Peng, A., & Patterson, M. M. (2022). Relations among cultural identity, motivation for language learning, and perceived English language proficiency for international students in the United States. *Lang. Cult. Curric.* 35, 67–82. doi: 10.1080/07908318.2021.1938106
- Petreñas, C., Lapresta, C., & Huguet, Á. (2018). Redefining cultural identity through language in young Romanian migrants in Spain. *Lang. Intercult. Commun.* 18, 225–240. doi: 10.1080/14708477.2016.122141
- Pidduck, R. J., Shaffer, M. A., Zhang, Y., et al. (2022). Cultural intelligence: an identity lens on the influence of cross-cultural experience. *J. Int. Manag.* 28, 100928. doi: 10.1016/j.intman.2022.100928
- Rahman, T. (1997). The Urdu-English Controversy in Pakistan. *Modern Asian Studies.* 31(1), 177-207.
- Rahman, T. (2004). *Language Policy and Localization in Pakistan: Proposal for a Paradigmatic Shift*.
- Song, J. (2010). Language ideology and identity in transnational space: Globalization, migration, and bilingualism among Korean families in the USA. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism.* 13(1), 23–42.
- Rentschler, R., Fillis, I., & Lee, B. (2023). National identity and the future of branding the arts. *Futures.* 145, 103078. doi: 10.1016/j.futures.2022.103078
- Sang, Y. (2023). Uncovering language socialization mechanisms in language teacher identity formation: an ethnographic study in a Chinese culture class. *Linguist. Educ.* 73, 101138. doi: 10.1016/j.linged.2022.101138
- Spiliotopoulos, V., & Carey, S. (2005). Investigating the role of identity in writing using electronic bulletin boards. *The Canadian Modern Language Review.* 62(1), 87–109.
- Ting-Toomey, S. (2015). Identity negotiation theory. In: *The International Encyclopedia of Interpersonal Communication*. John Wiley & Sons. pp. 1–10. doi: 10.1002/9781118540190.wbeic129
- Vygotsky, L. (1978). *Mind in society*. Harvard University Press.
- Wenger, E. (1998). *Communities of practice: Learning, meaning and identity*. Cambridge University Press.
- Woodward, K. (2002). *Understanding identity*. Arnold.
- Zhang, L., & Hwang, Y. (2023). "Should I change myself or not?": examining (re) constructed language teacher identity during the COVID-19 pandemic through textmining. *Teach. Teach. Educ.* 127, 104092. doi: 10.1016/j.tate.2023.104092